



402 LEE STREET  
DECATUR, ALABAMA 35601  
September 12, 2024  
**MINUTES**

---

Council Chambers

Architectural Review Board

4:00 PM

---

**I CALL MEETING TO ORDER 4:00 PM**

**Roll Call:**

Present: Ellis Chenault, Barbara Kelly, Patrick Rasco, Jacob Woods

Absent: Michael Rogers

**II APPROVAL OF MINUTES: August 8, 2024**

**Vote:** Motion made by Elis Chenault to approve the CoA as submitted. Seconded by Barbra Kelly. Unanimous approval, motion carried.

**III EXPEDITED CoAs SINCE THE AUGUST MEETING:**

301 Oak Street NE (Dickson) new roof (#47 for the CoA)  
224 Davis Street NE (Bachus) new roof (#47 for the CoA)  
622 Johnston Street SE (Griffin) replace rotting siding (#54 for the CoA)  
421 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue SE (Dupper) new side door lights (#38 for the CoA)  
406 Canal Street NE (Perrin) new roof (#47 for the CoA)  
426 Sherman Street SE (Rhodes) tree removal (#61 for the CoA)  
809 Line Street NE (Thomas) sidewalks (#64 for the CoA)  
638 Jackson Street SE (Clark) front porch handrails (#53 for the CoA)  
120 Cherry Street NE (Odom) storm damage repair (#9 and 54 for the CoA)  
623 Johnston Street SE (Mattern) replace rotting siding (#9 for the CoA)  
113 Cain Street NE (Browning) front yard fence (#26 for the CoA)

**IV NEW CoA REVIEWS:**

**CoA #1: 623 Jackson Street SE (Lovelace)**

**Background:** This Colonial Revival 4-Square is located in the Albany District. It has an asbestos roof with diamond shaped shingles that is leaking and has reached the end of

its life. Staff typically fast tracks shingle replacements, but in this instance, the property owner has requested a style that has not been approved before. Thus staff has brought this application to the full board for review.

**Action Requested:** Replace asbestos roofing with a specialty shingle design

**Decatur's Design Review Standards:** 13.0 Roofs: 13.7 Repair and replacement of asbestos shingled roof should be with cement-fiber shingles or a compatible material. Select an alternative material compatible in appearance and profile. 13.8 It is not appropriate to create a false historical appearance by adding conjectural features without historical, pictorial, or physical documentation.

**Staff Assessment:** The diamond shaped shingles that have historically been used on past renovations are no longer manufactured. For the last year staff has been unable to locate a manufacturer with a local distribution network that makes the diamond shingle shape. The ARB has ruled that standard architectural shingles are an appropriate replacement until a historically closer profile can be located.

The proposed carriage house shingles are designed to mimic slate with their dog-eared profile pg 3 of the manufacturer's pamphlet states they "*create a one-of-a kind look of scalloped-edge natural slate*". The commission has historically not approved a slate design to replace asbestos or architectural shingles, in the past the commission has referred to 13.7 and 13.8 in requiring a matching profile, or if not available, to use a standard composition shingle. Two houses within the Old Decatur district that have needed to replace their asbestos shingles this past year were directed to use a standard architectural shingle.

A 1913 Sanborn Fire Insurance Map for Decatur coded the roof as having wood shingles. Wood shingled roofs were replaced with 3 tab or architectural composition roofing on all homes within the city by the mid-20<sup>th</sup> century.

**Discussion:** Discussion on how the diamond shaped shingles by Pabsco or standard architectural shingles are more appropriate. Discussion with applicant if they are willing to accept an amended CoA with the change in shingle to one of those two options. Applicant agrees. Staff discusses which color the applicant would like, interested in Oakwood or Antique Black.

**Vote:** Motion made by Jacob Woods for an amended CoA to have the PABSCO diamond shaped shingles or standard architectural shingles approved by staff. Seconded by Patrick Rasco. Unanimous approval, motion carried.

**CoA #2: 626 Sherman Street SE (Mosher)**

**Background:** This 1930s Colonial Revival house is located in the Albany district. One of the wood columns is deteriorating and has reached a point where it cannot be repaired, it needs replacing.

**Action Requested:** Replace a single front wood column with a fiberglass column

**Decatur's Design Review Standards:** 12.0 Porches: 12.2 Replace in-kind with appropriate materials. Alternative materials that duplicate the appearance, texture, and architectural detail may be considered. Replacement elements should match the original in size, shape, pattern, color, and texture.

**Staff Assessment:** Staff has worked closely with the property owner and the manufacturing company on this project. There is no exact match for this profile in wood or fiberglass, but we have located a close match with the capital in a fiberglass column. The board has authorized fiberglass columns for certain applications in the past.

**Discussion:** Discussion of if other columns will need replacement. Applicant says there is a possibility.

**Vote:** Motion made by Jacob Woods to approve the CoA as submitted and to give staff the authority to approve administratively any additional column replacements on the front porch if/when necessary. Seconded by Ellis Chenault. Unanimous approval, motion carried.

Motion to adjourn meeting at 4:31 by Ellis Chenault, seconded by Patrick Rasco. Unanimous approval, motion carried. Meeting adjourned.